Green Entrepreneurial Practices Among SMEs in Malaysia and Nigeria

Abdullahi Hassan Gorondutse\(^1\), Maruf Gbadebo Salimon\(^2\), Siti Noratisah Binti Mohd Nafi\(^3\), Mohd Rashdan Bin Salehudden\(^4\), Yahya Saleh Ibrahim\(^5\), Yusha’u Ibrahim Ango\(^6\), and Maharazu Ibrahim\(^7\)

\(^1\)Department of Economics and Management Science, Nigeria Police Academy, Wudil, Kano
\(^2\)\(^3\)Universiti Utara Malaysia
\(^4\)\(^5\)\(^6\)\(^7\)Kaduna State University, Kaduna, Nigeria
*ahgdutse@gmail.com

**Abstract**—Entrepreneurial programs had paid great in assisting humanity. This action changes common man the way they live apart from generating careers. Despite the significant influence of entrepreneurship towards evolving a country’s economy’s growth these actions have its own weaknesses. Therefore, green entrepreneurs are trying to shape the behavior of doing business to emphasize the society’s new concerns on environmentalism and other ecological issues as they touch their business. Recently Green entrepreneurs are being seen important parts in the transition to green economies. World evidence indicates that people are increasingly becoming concerned about the environment and are gradually changing their behaviors accordingly. Since green entrepreneurial practices by SMEs in many countries were still in nascent stage it was recommended that relevant stakeholders should put in place measures meant to spur adoption and implementation by most entities including SMEs. Consequently, this research examines the state of green entrepreneurship and explores key factors that can towards helping green entrepreneurship specifically among SMEs in Malaysia and Nigeria by means of a quantitative method. Hence, it’s expected that the result of this study can pay meaningfully during policy design among government agencies answerable for environmental protection, this will encourage green entrepreneurship in Malaysia and Nigeria. The output of this research is significantly essential to the business owners as well as to the decision makers.

**Keywords**— Green Entrepreneurial practices, Availability of capital, Entrepreneur motivations, Entrepreneur skills, SMEs, Malaysia and Nigeria

1. **Introduction:**

Nowadays, the issue of environmental awareness is critical issue among the organizations. Therefore, the entrepreneur and consumers are looking for the better ways to reduce waste, wisely utilize the natural material and minimize our impact on the environment. Most of the entrepreneurs also build innovative rules by given new products, creating more well organized and effective processes, and transforming ways that direct to the enhancement of new markets, and influencing new norms, belief and attitude \([1],[2]\).

The key feature differentiating the green entrepreneurs from the old-style entrepreneurs is the fact that, green entrepreneur pursues to make a business perfect that concern economically lucrative and produces environmental and social value. Most of the green entrepreneur organizes this by doing in actions such as ecotourism, recycling, energy efficiency, sustainable mobility, organic agriculture and renewable energy among others, and many number of green jobs that related to these new programs \([3]\). The economic environment is generally moving towards “greening” economic activities in Nigeria and Malaysia. Entrepreneurs are not left out for they are encouraged to come up with businesses that are “green.”

In Malaysia, the fact regarding the issue of supportable actions among small and medium enterprises (SMEs) is quiet very limited. Some scholar like \([4]\) emphasized that SMEs operate on environmental organisation practices remained few as compared than larger firms. This idea of green practices is silent identical novel to Malaysian SME owners/managers, despite numerous attempts on green conferences, discussions and movements were obtainable in different situation. This is to say that the idea for green practices and products in Malaysia is at the early phase. This means that there is only a slight information near the green idea in Malaysia, upon of all actions from public and private organisations. The question now is that “are Malaysian SME owners/managers aware with the green idea and care about the environment”? Hence, the need to understand the effect of owners/managers insight and brashness to green idea are imperious, considering the trend globally indicate that the environmental consciousness of customers has made to pursue for environmentally sociable products/services. Previous examinations indicated that the application of green management actions is subjective by current and prospect stakeholder sets in the procedure of outside burdens from lawmakers, environmental groups, financial institutions and suppliers, and at the same time within the business, by employees and owner/manager attitudes and information. Green
entrepreneurial practices (GEP) idea may be look in diver’s viewpoint from one nation to another [3], [6], and in Malaysia, from one city to additional city due to the diverse values and socio-economic situations of each city. based on this, it become necessary to examines the degree to which Malaysian SMEs owners/managers are conscious of green idea and the causal benefits that this idea brought.

Inspire of significant of entrepreneurship to economy of any nation. Its important to consider the issue of sustainability environment in the business. Therefore, its necessary for the Nigeria entrepreneurs to start the idea of green economy and what are the likely prospect offered for green entrepreneur in Nigeria. Its apparent that the answer and efforts of environmentalists and governments is not enough to yield the anticipated economic and environmental consequences, and this means businesses (entrepreneurs) show an important part in fighting environmental tasks. Therefore, this study examined at the concept of green entrepreneurship and how it can improve economic actions in line entrepreneurial progress and produce prospects for entrepreneurs in Nigeria; due to the large degree of jobless people that necessity to remain involved in entrepreneurial actions to confirm a steady economy.

However, there has been slight study on green entrepreneurship in Malaysia and Nigeria and the world at large. The earlier terms adopted were “environmental entrepreneur” by [7], “green entrepreneur” by [8] and “eco-entrepreneur” by [9]. The little available literature that focuses on the factors leading to green entrepreneurship provides mixed findings. [10] found that entrepreneurs’ traits, skills and motivation were significant direct and indirect contributors to green entrepreneurship. [11] in the USA found that availability of opportunities had great effect on entrepreneurial activities. In another study by [12] in Indiana, USA, found that financial capital was an important factor for entrepreneurs. Another study by [13] in Finland showed that lighter taxation led to an increase in entrepreneurial activity. A study by [14] found that financial resources were not significantly related with emerging entrepreneurship. [15] in Malaysia found that only some incentives contributed to entrepreneurship while others did not. Thus, study is of significance to academics and other students; to administration policy makers and to stakeholders. In the academic arena, few studies have been done to determine why green entrepreneurship has not taken deep root in Nigeria and Malaysia.

2. Literature Review

2.1 Resource Dependence Theory (RDT)
RDT identify the effect of outside issues on organizational actions and, even though controlled by their context, therefore, managers can act to decrease environmental ambiguity and reliance [16], [17]. Thus, Organizational success in the resource dependency theory is referring as organizations increasing their influence [16]. This theory RDT suggests that actors required essential capital will search for to establish associations with others in order to attain needed resources [16].

This theory is significant to this study because it suggests that through green entrepreneurship a firm is able to gain independence from other organizations through actions like pollution control, call center based business services and renewable green recyclable projects, for instance bio-compression technology, bio-ethanol technology, algae for biodiesel production, biogas plants, improved cooking stoves, solar thermals, solar lanterns and thermo chemical technologies. This then can explain the perception of enterprises toward green business based on how they feel they can gain power and independence by participating in green business [16], [17].

2.2 Green Entrepreneurship

Green entrepreneurship is refer as creating new business that related to build up environmental pleasant products or services or to use renewable resources or for the advantage of the general public [18], [19], [2]. According to [20], thus; green entrepreneurship gives the foundation of new any green expansion models such as creating innovation firms in the way of environmental resolution and high excellence environmentally-friendly products, who considerably effect the nationalized market. Meanwhile, green entrepreneurship is also be seen as a fresh company commence in the environmental services or production industry, which purposeful on natural resources or natural situations for example: recycling, eco-tourism, waste water-treatment, and biodiversity [21], [2].

This research experiential on or after different study lessons, those meanings on green entrepreneurship for instance: [22]; [23]; [24]; [25]; [26]; [21] are related to the commence stage of a corporation and the ability of the individual or the corporation to bring into line actions with environmental defense. Green entrepreneurs are acceptance of environmental standards as a central part constituent of their distinctiveness and sighted
them as a competitive gain of their corporation in the global competition [27], [2].

[28] classified green entrepreneurs in to four groups that can help predict the motivations behind green entrepreneurship: the ad hoc enviropreneur, the advanced chance, the moral individualist and the expectation winning. The ad hoc enviropreneurs is a generous of unintentional green entrepreneur. The inspiration of the ad hoc enviropreneurs is finance-driven not values-driven. Further, they are mostly influenced by personal networks, family and friends to become green entrepreneurs. The innovative freebooter entrepreneur is usually inclined by motivators such as guideline that may lead to the recognition of a green business opportunity. The innovative opportunist is analogous to a monetarily leaning entrepreneur who spots a green niche or prospect in the market [27], [2].

There are various factors contributing towards green entrepreneurship and the section discusses how entrepreneurial skills, availability of capital for green entrepreneurship, and entrepreneur motivation as evidenced by studies done may contribute towards green entrepreneurship.

2.3 Entrepreneurial Skills
entrepreneurial skill is an individual capability to turn ideas into action, which include creativity, innovation and risk-taking, as well as the capacity to plan and manage projects in order to achieved objectives. Previous research indicates significant relation between entrepreneurial skills and SMEs performance [2]. In the study conducted by [10] on the relationship between entrepreneurial traits and skills and ensuing venture growth. Based on the study the skills in the study were passion, tenacity and new resource skills, longitudinal data was employed in the study was from 229 entrepreneur-chief administrative officers and 106 associates in a sole industry obtained over a 6-year period. The study found that specific component variables of entrepreneurs’ traits, skills and motivation groups following initial measurement were important direct or indirect forecasters of venture growth for a period of 6 years [29], [2].

[30] conducted an explorative case study to establish the strategic entrepreneurial skills desirable for well performance of SMEs that are operational in Oyo and Osun in the Western parts of Nigeria. The research conducted data on the effect of strategic entrepreneurial skills on service delivery of small businesses in Nigeria. The study used multistage probability technique of certain block making enterprises in Oyo and Osun, western Nigeria. Self-administered questionnaires on 240 block making enterprises were used to collect primary data that was used for the analysis. The study utilized Chi-square and ANOVA and findings established a positive association existed between the performance and strategic entrepreneurial skills [29], [2].

The studies cited above generally indicated that there was a significant association between the skills of entrepreneurs and their entrepreneurship. However, the findings cannot be generalized to all environments because the skills owned by entrepreneurs vary from one place to place. None of the studies shows whether the findings were based on particular skills. As a result, the findings may not apply to Malaysia and Nigeria, which is the location of this study.

2.4 Availability of Capital for Green Entrepreneurship
In a study [31] likened the accessibility of diverse kinds of funding sources and their consequences on entrepreneurial propensity. In the study they scrutinized the effect of business costs by utilizing a compound index considering information from the World Bank. Base on the finding it revealed that informal investments had statistically significant effect on entrepreneurial tendency. However Regulatory business costs shows to deter opportunity driven entrepreneurship but had no influence on inevitability entrepreneurship [31], [29], [2].

[14] conducted a study to test the theory that individual financial resources were significant issue in attractive an entrepreneur, based on the information from the panel study of entrepreneurial dynamics. The study also observed the impact of financial resources like household income and wealth, among other variables, on the choice to have interest to be an entrepreneurship. Based on finding it was revealed that financial resources were not significantly related with attractive to be an emerging entrepreneur [29]. These studies show mixed findings on the effect of financial capital on entrepreneurship. While some studies find a positive result, others find no relationship.

It is, therefore, reasonable to state that the available literature review concerning the relationship between financial, and entrepreneurship cannot be used to predict how capital affects green entrepreneurship among SMEs in Malaysia and Nigeria. This can only be established by conducting a study.
2.5 Entrepreneur Motivation

[32] conducted a study to examine issues that contributed to the accomplishment of innovative ventures in Nigeria. The study used profitability and growth as a proxy of achievement. This study categories entrepreneurial motivations based on whether the entrepreneurs are internally or externally inspired [32], [29]. When tested against profitability and growth, based on the finding it was revealed that externally motivated entrepreneurs were more likely to attain a better degree of profitability than the internally motivated entrepreneurs. On the other hand, the internally motivated entrepreneurs will result to involvement a better degree of growth than externally motivated entrepreneurs [29].

[33] sought to establish association between success motivation and variables related with entrepreneurial actions. This study was a meta-study on various studies done on the association between success motivation and entrepreneurial behaviour. Based on the finding found that success motivation was significantly connected with both choice of an entrepreneurial career and entrepreneurial performance. These studies have shown that there is a association between motivation and entrepreneurial behaviour. However, they have not shown whether motivation is positively related to entrepreneurship or not. Further, the findings are not to be taken as universal since motivation is a behavioural issue that varies with context and stimulus. The studies do not provide the explanation that will relate motivation and entrepreneurship within the green context in Malaysia and Nigeria.

Thus the research framework is designed as the following:

```
Entrepreneurial Skills  Green Entrepreneurial Practices
Availability of Capital
Entrepreneurial Motivations
```

Figure 1
Research Framework

3. Research Methodology

This study is a descriptive survey. [34] indicated that in a survey research the researcher attempts to collect data from members of a population and describes an existing phenomenon where individuals are ask about their awareness attitudes, comportment or values. In an examination, the researcher explores the existing status of two or more variables at a given point in time. The target population is 200 entrepreneurs in Malaysia and Nigeria. The sample of study was 200 taken within the area bounded simple random sampling is utilized. This is line with recommendation by [35] stated that in social science research a sample size of 15 participant per predictor. However, [36] argued that the sample size of 35-500 should be enough since it depends on the sampling method and research question under study. This method was viewed as necessary especially in Nigeria, a country where no availability of sampling frame and access to data based. The hypotheses will be about the direct effect of the independent constructs to the dependent construct as per model above. Self-administered questionnaires were employed given to either the manager of the SME or one of the staff incorporate in the day-to-day management of the business in order to overcome common method bias (CMV) as recommended by [37]. The data were coded and checked for any errors and omissions. Descriptive statistics are used to analyze the data collected. The descriptive statistics used included mean and standard deviation. Equally, the Smart PLS-SEM was used for hypothesis testing this because of the popularity as the most suitable technique by prior researchers. PLS - SEM path modeling is seen as a conventional regression technique that takes advantage of large and rigorous data in estimating the relationships between structural models construct. Again, it also contributes in evaluating and estimating the relationships between the study indicators and their corresponding latent constructs of the measurement model simultaneously [38], [39].

4. Result

4.1 Descriptive Statistic

This section represents descriptive statistics that underlined the mean and standard deviation as shown in Table 1 below. According to [34], mean is the common measure of central tendency which is the average value of a given data set. On the other hand, standard deviation is a measure of variability or spread which provides an index of dispersion in the data set, and it is the square root of variance. Mean and standard deviation are important descriptive statistics for interval and ratio scale. In general, Table 1 presents the overall mean for the latent variables ranged between 3.12 and 3.69.
Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Mean*</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>Mean**</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Availability of capital</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Entrepreneur motivation</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td>3.32</td>
<td>.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Entrepreneur skills</td>
<td>3.47</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>.87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Green entrepreneur</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td>.61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: * represent Malaysian Model and ** represent Kaduna Model.

Therefore, based on the computed results, mean for green entrepreneur shows a moderate level at 3.52. This suggests the respondents have moderated levels of perceptions towards green practices. For the latent variable’s entrepreneur skills showed a mean value of 3.47 whilst availability of capital had a mean of 3.65. Thus, these pointed out that respondents had a moderate level of perception of these two concepts. Whereas, entrepreneur motivation with a mean of 3.69 showed that the respondents had a high-level perception of their green practices in Malaysia, other details see Table 1.

4.2 Multicollinearity

This study has followed the suggestions of [40] on the issue of multicollinearity which can be checked through variance inflation factors (VIF). This method suggests that to discover multicollinearity is to examine data at the variance inflated factor (VIF) and tolerance value. [40] asserted that any VIF exceeding the value of 5 indicates a problem of multicollinearity. Table 2 as shown below is of the VIF values of independent variables.

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Malaysia</th>
<th>Kaduna</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Availability of capital</td>
<td>2. 503</td>
<td>1. 272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>2. 041</td>
<td>1. 439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>2. 664</td>
<td>1. 253</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3 Assessment of Measurement Model

Measurement model in this section is intended for ensuring that the model specification is valid and reliable. Therefore, in line with the findings of [40], it clearly follows the rule of thumb that for an outer loading to be considered such a model, it should be 0.7 and above. Meanwhile for the average variance extracted (AVE), it should also be greater than 0.5. Outer loading basically focuses on assessing the individual items’ reliability for each construct. On top that, in this path model assessment section, it is important to take note that according to [2013] goodness-of-fit index is not that appropriate for model validation.

Based on this literature, all the items with outer loading below 0.7 were deleted beginning with the data with the lowest value, a technique which according to [40] is very appropriate because it improves data quality. Thus, based on the analysis, no such issue has been detected. SmartPLS software [41] was used to assess the reliability and validity as well as to test the structural/hypothesized model and moderating effect. An examination of the loadings and cross loadings serve as a pre-requisite for ascertaining the convergent validity. Thus based on the result the data for both Malaysia and Kaduna the data achieved convergent validity and reliability.

4.4 Assessment of Significance of the Structural and Hypothesized Model

The previous section evaluated the measurement model. In the following section, the focus is on examining the structural model. The structural model is employed to test the hypotheses for this study. This study also employed standard bootstrapping procedure to assess the significance of the path coefficients as suggested by [40]. Thus, the testing of the hypotheses in this study includes assessment on the direct hypothesis effect and the moderating effects.

Therefore, the fundamental objective of the structural model is to test the hypothesized relationships among constructs. The structural model evaluation began with an examination of the direct relationships in this study. Two hypotheses that posed a direct relationship in this study were tested out of which the entire hypotheses were supported. The direct path relationship is shown in Figure 2 which described the direct effect of every latent variable on the dependent variable.
The output of Figure 2a above was fully clarified in Table 3 which indicates the path coefficients, t-values, and standard error which are used as the basis for testing hypotheses. The t-values for this research were calculated using 5000 re-sampling iterations in repetitive bootstrapping as recommended by [40]. According to [39], the above techniques can be equally justified for a 5000 sample by ensuring that every model’s parameter has empirical sampling distribution. These researchers also added that the standard deviation of the distribution will serve as proxy of the parameter for empirical standard error. Thus, the results for the hypothesis testing is shown in Table 3.

### Table 3a

**Results of Hypothesis Testing (Malaysia)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>Std Bet</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>P Value</th>
<th>Decisions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AC -&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EM -&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.673</td>
<td>Not Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES -&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.005</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The above Table 3a indicates that only one hypothesis of the study hypotheses was accepted and possesses a t-value which is greater than 1.96 and it is adequate to support the direct hypotheses. Hypothesis 1 predicted availability of capital will influence green practices. Accordingly, the results revealed a significant relationship between availability of capital and green practices ($\beta = 0.946$, $t = 4.149$). Thus, it supports Hypothesis 1.

Moving on, Hypothesis 2 predicted that entrepreneur’s motivation will significantly influence green practices ($\beta = -0.014$, $t = 0.422$). Hence, it not supports Hypothesis 2.

Hypothesis 3 predicted that entrepreneur’s skills will significantly influence green practices. Consequently, the results revealed a significant relationship between entrepreneur’s skills and green practices ($\beta = 0.166$, $t = 2.812$). Hence, it supports Hypothesis 3.

### Figure 2b

**Structural Model (Kaduna)**

Table 3b

**Results of Hypothesis Testing (Kaduna)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Path Coefficient</th>
<th>Std Bet</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>P Value</th>
<th>Decisions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AC -&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>0.139</td>
<td>0.490</td>
<td>0.624</td>
<td>Not Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EM -&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>0.123</td>
<td>5.293</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES -&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.125</td>
<td>0.158</td>
<td>0.874</td>
<td>Not Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** ***Significant at 0.001 (2-tailed), **significant at 0.005 (2-tailed),

The above Table 3b indicates that only one hypothesis of the study hypotheses was accepted and possesses a t-value which is greater than 1.96 and it is adequate to support the direct hypotheses. Hypothesis 1 predicted availability of capital will influence green practices. Accordingly, the results revealed there is no significant relationship between availability of capital and green practices ($\beta = 0.068$, $t = 0.490$). Thus, it not supports
Hypothesis 1. Moving on, Hypothesis 2 predicted that entrepreneur’s motivation will significantly influence green practices. Consequently, the results revealed a significant relationship between entrepreneur’s motivation and green practices ($\beta = 0.652$, $t = 5.293$). Hence, it supports Hypothesis 2.

Hypothesis 3 predicted that entrepreneur’s skills will significantly influence green practices ($\beta = 0.020$, $t = 0.158$). Hence, it does not support Hypothesis 3.

The next assessment underlined $R^2$ value as another criterion in assessing the structural model. $R^2$ value is well-known as the determinant for coefficient $[40]$. $[42]$ suggested that $R^2$ value of 0.02 is weak, the value of 0.13 is Moderate, and 0.26 is regarded as substantial. Thus, in line with $[42]$ categorization, the result of this study’s $R^2$ value as shown in Table 4 below is substantial. Mostly, the $R^2$ values indicated that all the study variables of availability of capital, motivation, and skills can influence 72% of the changes in the dependent variable which is green practices in Malaysia. Similarly, in the context of Kaduna, $R^2$ revealed 48%.

Table 4
Holistic Effects of availability of capital, Motivation, Skills on Green Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Constructs</th>
<th>R Square Malaysia</th>
<th>R Square Kaduna</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Availability of capital</td>
<td>0.718</td>
<td>0.482</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivation</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>0.343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills</td>
<td>0.081</td>
<td>0.571</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The study variables explain 72% 48% variation in Green Practices for Malaysia and Kaduna respectively

4.5 Effect Size ($f^2$)

According to $[42]$, effect size explains the relative effects of proposed exogenous latent variables on the endogenous latent variable that take place due to the changes in $R^2$. The researcher had further noted that the value being computed as the increase in $R^2$ of latent variables on the connected path, relative to the proportions of unexplained variance.

Thus, there is a need to know the individual contribution of the observed variables to criterion through the calculation of the effect sizes of the predicting variables. Hence, only the results of the effect size $f^2$ of the three (3) hypotheses that were statistically supported are reported for both Malaysia and Kaduna. The effect size $f^2$ is calculated using the formula as advanced by $[42]$ as given below:

\[
\text{Effect size } f^2 = \frac{R^2_{\text{included}} - R^2_{\text{excluded}}}{1 - R^2_{\text{included}}}
\]

According to Cohen $[42]$, suggested $f^2$ values of 0.02 are noted to have a small effect, 0.15 represent the medium effect and 0.35 having a large effect. A brief explanation on $R^2$ included and $R^2$ excluded is that they represent the $R$-squares on the predicting variable wherein when the independent variable is present it is considered $R^2$ included or when it is withheld, then it is $R^2$ excluded. This eventually translates the effect of the variance of every variable. Table 5 below represents the effect sizes of the latent variables of structural model.

Table 5a
Relationship Effects Size and Rating (Malaysia)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>$f^2$</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AC-&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.081</td>
<td>Small</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EM-&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.060</td>
<td>Small</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES-&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.343</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5b
Relationship Effects Size and Rating (Kaduna)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship</th>
<th>$f^2$</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AC-&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.007</td>
<td>Small</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EM-&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.571</td>
<td>Large</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ES-&gt; GE</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>Small</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on Table 5a and 5b above, the effect sizes of the supported relationships with their respective $t$-values, effect size and their rating are according to $[42]$ criterion. Thus, the results show that out of the three direct hypotheses for Malaysia model two of them possess a small rating whereas the other Entrepreneurs skills variable has a medium strength, whereas the results of Kaduna model indicates that two of them possess a small rating whereas the other Entrepreneurs motivation variable has a large strength. Nevertheless, $[38]$ argued that even the smallest $f^2$ strength is considered significant due to the fact that they may have an impact on the measure construct.

4.6 Predictive Relevance of the Model

Predictive relevance of the model is intended to assess the predictive capability of a model. The
proposed approach to assess predictive relevance is by implementing blindfolding techniques. This blindfolding technique was proposed by [43]. Moreover, [39] underlined that the cross-validated redundancy measure \(Q^2\) is used as a criterion to measure how well the research model can predict the data of cases that was omitted.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Construct Cross Validated Redundancy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dependent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I- SSE/SSO (Q^2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6

As shown in Table 6 above, this study’s research model has predictive relevance. Thus, this result is in line with [40] that suggested that if \(Q^2 > 0\), the model has a predictive relevance whilst if \(Q^2 < 0\), the model does not pose any predictive ability. Hence, the predictors above for both the models (Malaysian and Kaduna) possess a value that is greater than zero indicating sound predictive model relevance present.

4.7 Discussion

The first research question of this present study was whether entrepreneur skills influenced green practices amongst SMEs Malaysia and Nigeria. Consistent with this research question, the first objective of this study was to examine the influence between entrepreneur skills and green practices amongst SMEs Malaysia and Nigeria. In this study, entrepreneur refers to the extend entrepreneur have enough knowledge and training to embark on green practices. The finding of the output based on Malaysia SMEs shows consistent with the previous studies [30], [2], [29]. However, for Kaduna SMEs the result reveal insignificant result, hence not consistent with previous research, this may be due lack of training and program that can trained the entrepreneur to learnt on green practice by relevant authority to SMEs in Kaduna.

The second research question of this present study was whether availability of capital influenced green practices amongst SMEs Malaysia and Nigeria. Consistent with this research question, the second objective of this study was to examine the influence between availability of capital and green practices amongst SMEs Malaysia and Nigeria. In this study, availability of capital refers to the extend entrepreneur have enough resources to embark on green practices. The finding of the output based on Malaysia SMEs shows consistent with the previous studies [31], [2] and [29]. However, for Kaduna SMEs the result reveal insignificant result, hence not consistent with previous research, this may be due lack of funds by relevant authority to SMEs in Kaduna.

The third research question of this present study was whether entrepreneur motivation influenced green practices amongst SMEs Malaysia and Nigeria. Consistent with this research question, the third objective of this study was to examine the influence between entrepreneur motivation and green practices amongst SMEs Malaysia and Nigeria. In this study, entrepreneur motivation refers to the extend entrepreneur were internally and externally motivated to embark on green practices. The finding of the output based on Malaysia SMEs shows consistent with the previous studies. However, for Kaduna SMEs the result reveal significant result, hence consistent with previous research [32], [29]. this may be due to awareness on important of green practices by relevant authority to SMEs in Kaduna.

5 Conclusion, Implications and Recommendations

This research examines green entrepreneurship practices in Malaysia and Nigeria. The green entrepreneur is an actor in the green economy that embodies the marriage of economy and environment, Green economy policies can help developing countries attain economic and social gains on several fronts. Conclusions of the study findings are advanced based on the relationships that were established for each of the different research objectives. From the foregoing summary, it can be concluded that green entrepreneurial practices as an emerging practice is progressively gaining popularity among SMEs in Malaysia and Nigeria and was found to be practiced by an appreciable number of the SMEs.

Theoretically, this study has contributed to Resource Dependence Theory (RTD) by combining the study variable to empirically test in the context of Malaysia and Nigeria. The study has added value by contributing to the growth of literature, particularly on the influence the green entrepreneurship. This is specifically significant for those businesses in emerging economies, as organisations and firms are not well-established that may directly influence firms’ strategic placing.

Practically, it becomes imperative for the entrepreneurs, institutions, government and all stakeholders to consider green entrepreneurship as
an opportunity for the development of entrepreneurship in in Malaysia and Nigeria. For instance, Nigeria is endowed with a huge deposit of natural resources and most of our cities are littered with waste that is not properly disposed or managed. Entrepreneurs can take advantage of these opportunities and start up green businesses resulting in entrepreneurial development; and millions of jobs are created in the process for our ever-growing population. This paper recommends that Research and development in the area of green entrepreneurship and green jobs, this will foster the development of green entrepreneurial activities among SMEs particularly in Nigeria. Public orientation programmes to enlighten the populace on the benefits of green economy and green entrepreneurship to sustainability and economic growth in Malaysia and Nigeria. That the government puts in place the necessary policies and the enabling entrepreneurial environment to encourage entrepreneurs in green innovations and businesses as well as the need to incorporate green entrepreneurship into entrepreneurial development in Malaysia and Nigeria.

Limitations of the Study
SMEs sector in Malaysia and Nigeria is comprised of several players involved in various entrepreneurial practices, green entrepreneurial practices being an upcoming innovation. only a few respondents exhibiting green entrepreneurial tendencies were involved in the study. Since the study involved only a few industry players, the sample may not be representative of all industry players in Malaysia and Nigeria. The results of the study may also be limited by time constrains.

Suggestions for further research
It is suggested that a study on the perceptions of longitudinal of population on the operations green technology be undertaken to help strengthen the County’s policies related to this sector in both Malaysia and Nigeria. Future research can focus on the factors that promote effective growth of SMEs in green entrepreneurship in Malaysia and Nigeria is also worth investing in. Equally significant is a inclusion of other factors that affect SMEs involved in green entrepreneurship in Malaysia ad Nigeria.

References


[38] Chin, W. W., Marcolin, B. L., & Newsted, P. R. A partial least squares latent variable modeling approach for measuring interaction effects: Results from a Monte Carlo Simulation study and an electronic-mail emotion/ adoption study. *Information Systems Research, 14*, 189-217. 2003.


