

Published or Perished: Harnessing Consolidated Procurement of National Reference Books

Zaidan Fajar Nurmansyah^{#1}, Desy Hariyati^{*2}

#Public Administration Department, Faculty of Administrative Science, University of Indonesia, Indonesia

¹Zaidan.fajar@ui.ac.id

²Desy.Hariyati@ui.ac.id

Abstract— Public procurement is generally carried out in isolation without coordination and integration in the process. Consequently, a number of issues may occur, such as the high number of procurement packages, high administrative cost, and high purchasing cost. Consolidated procurement comes as a potential strategy to improve the quality of procurement process. Consolidated procurement has successfully been carried out by the Government of Indonesia through the National Public Procurement Agency (LKPP) for the procurement of national reference books for the primary, junior, and senior high schools. This paper reports on the implementation, challenges, and benefits at every stage of the consolidated procurement of the national reference books in Indonesia. This study employed a qualitative approach and method by interviewing informants selected through purposive sampling. The informants in this research came from the Ministry of Education and Culture, the National Public Procurement Agency (LKPP), and book publishers as procurement vendors. Data analysis was conducted through open, selective, and axial coding whereby data from different informants were triangulated. The findings suggested that the consolidated procurement of the national reference books, which was conducted in three phases, namely planning, tendering, and contract delivery, involved several strategies and faced a number of challenges. Studies on and practice of consolidated procurement of goods/services in Indonesia remain limited. Therefore, this article is expected to serve as a reference for future studies and for practitioners/government who wish to conduct consolidated procurement.

Keywords— *Consolidated procurement, challenge of consolidated procurement, Advantage of consolidated procurement, national reference books, procurement of goods/services in Indonesia,*

1. Introduction

The implementation of procurement of goods/services is central to and plays a strategic role in the attainment of organizational goal. This is in line with the paradigm shift from viewing procurement as a technical administrative activity to viewing it as a strategic activity. Procurement of goods/services is a strategic activity, as it is an economic driver contributing to the national economy and the welfare of the people, and also since procurement of goods/services particularly in the public sector is closely linked to the delivery of state budget [1]. Additionally, procurement of goods/services by the government also plays an important role in state and government activities, as it facilitates the working units within ministries/ government agencies/ regional government agencies to meet their goals as well as to deliver their budget in accordance with the procurement

principles and ethics [2]. Therefore, a fairly large budget is required to ensure the delivery of procurement of goods/services [3].

The strategic role of procurement is not without risks, including budget misuse through cost mark-up, administrative violation, and incompetent procurement committee. With regards to risks associated with procurement of goods/services, there are four risks that may arise during procurement of goods/services, namely risks in the need assessment, risks in the planning, risks in relation to the selection method, and risks during the management of contract [4]. In addition to risks, the massive budget in procurement of goods/services, which increases annually, is also prone to corruption. The procurement of goods/services done by governments not only in Indonesia but also internationally is a fertile ground for corruption [5; 6]. Furthermore, procurement has been confirmed as the largest contributor to corruption cases in Indonesia [7].

Issues related to procurement of goods/services are not limited to corruption. LKPP's 2018 performance report lists other problems: (1) the existing practice of procurement of goods/services that is not in line with the prevailing laws and regulations, (2) the development and demand for change in the procurement system to give value for money for the people, (3) lack of commitment among heads of regional governments in the implementation of e-procurement, and (4) inadequate incentive or allowance for procurement management officers, making the position less attractive, incommensurate with the associated potential risks [8]. Another challenge in procurement of goods/services concerns issues of coordination among units within an organization. Procurement is often viewed as the need of an individual unit and unrelated to the need of other units or the organization. Consequently, it is not uncommon to find that within one organization there is a massive procurement budget coming from different units within the organization. This, in turn, leads to the unnecessarily high administrative activities related to the procurement, high purchasing cost due to the small procurement packages, and extended procurement period [9]. Furthermore, isolated procurement activities and silo mentality among units are common.

To respond to these issues, a novel strategy in procurement of goods/services is required in Indonesia. One potential strategy that the government can adopt is consolidated

procurement [2]. Consolidated procurement has not become a mainstream strategy in government agencies in Indonesia, both at the central and regional levels. Although the government has issued a regulation regarding consolidated procurement through Presidential Decree Number 16 of 2018 on Procurement of Goods/Services, consolidated procurement practice has remained uncommon. Consolidated procurement is an effort and strategy to increase the value for money from the procurement of goods/services process by considering various aspects relating to procurement, such as regulations, time, and human resource [8]. Furthermore, consolidation is one strategy that can be adopted by organizations to rationalize and minimize procurement budget [10]. Afterwards, consolidated procurement can potentially reduce purchasing price and transaction cost, and increase negotiation and communication [11; 12]. Consolidated procurement can also lead to improved efficiency and reduced risks that can potentially occur at every stage of the procurement of goods/services cycle [14].

Although consolidated procurement had not become a common practice in Indonesia, the Government of Indonesia through LKPP attempted to conduct consolidated procurement at the national level for the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books for elementary, junior high, and senior high schools. Consolidation was motivated by the fact that there were a number of strategic issues in the previous procurement of national reference books. Among the issues was the considerably significant price gap for reference books on Java Island and those outside Java Island that led to some schools outside Java Island getting fewer books than the number of their students. The procurement of 2013 national curriculum reference books was the first consolidated procurement at a massive scale that went successfully. This procurement was carried out as there was a change in the curriculum, from School-based Curriculum (KTSP) to the 2013 National Curriculum with significant changes in the content standards [15]. Therefore, schools needed to have new reference books to implement the new curriculum. In order to implement the 2013 national curriculum, the government through the Ministry of Education and Culture prepared three scenarios for the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books. In the first scenario, the central government was fully responsible for the procurement. In the second scenario, the procurement was to be carried out together by the central government and regional government using the special allocation fund (DAK). In the third scenario, the procurement was to be carried out using the School Operational Fund (BOS) [16].

Therefore, in the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books, the central government prepared reference books for students and handbooks for teachers for each subject which would then be distributed to schools. In other words, the government determined the content for each book that would be used [17]. Furthermore, in this procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books, the central government through the Ministry of Education and Culture involved LKPP, whereby LKPP acted as the administrator for the

procurement and had four roles: determining the price and specifications for the 2013 national curriculum reference books, establishing the umbrella contract for the suppliers of the 2013 national curriculum reference books, publishing the catalogue for the 2013 national curriculum reference books (e-catalogue), and preparing the e-purchasing payment mechanism [18].

The Ministry of Education and Culture 2014 data showed that the total number of elementary schools, junior high schools and senior high schools in Indonesia was 206,799 and the number of students in all the three levels of education was 31,224,844. The total number of reference books that should have been distributed in the first semester of 2014/2015 academic year was 240 million copies; 123 million copies for elementary schools, 60 million copies for junior high schools, and 57 million copies for senior/vocational high schools. However, until end of August a large proportion of the reference books for senior/vocational high schools had yet to be distributed [7]. This was because suppliers could not deliver their contract because of inadequate fund (capital). This was due to the payment system whereby schools would directly pay to the suppliers using the School Operational Fund (BOS), requiring suppliers to spend a large amount of money in advance, while at the same time schools could not pay because the School Operational Fund had not been disbursed [19]. Another reason for the delay in the reference books distribution was because suppliers reported that they had not received reference books order [7].

2. Literature Review

Due to the tight competition among construction companies, one of the strategies to minimize budget in purchasing building materials is by adopting centralized procurement. It was found that inefficiency was rampant prior to the adoption of centralized procurement of building materials, so they advocate the adoption of centralized procurement due to its associated benefits. Therefore, the construction company was able to save 5% in the procurement cost by adopting the centralized procurement [20]. Moreover, centralized procurement enabled Mabata Rolling Mills to increase the organization performance as indicated by the increased company profit, increased overall company performance, larger market share, and improved efficiency within the company [21].

Centralized procurement in the public procurement of goods/services also has certain benefits, particularly with regards to cost and quality of goods, as compared to decentralized procurement [22]. Furthermore, centralized public procurement in Egypt could minimize state budget especially in routine procurement for example in the procurement of office consumables such as stationery. This was compared to decentralized procurement whereby all government agencies were given authority to conduct their own public procurement without a central agency responsible for public procurement of goods and services. Under this condition, agencies only focused only on their own procurement programs and planning, leading to inflated procurement budget for many years [23].

Similarly, centralized public procurement of goods/services was adopted to procure electronic devices for the Government of Brazil. Centralized procurement was opted due to its associated benefits, namely cost reduction due to economy of scale, standardized products and services, optimum quality of products and services, and better use of human resource. However, despite all these benefits, several issues still occurred in its implementation, namely delay in the procurement process due to the complexity of goods and services [24].

Consolidated procurement of goods/services could also reduce cost of drug purchasing in the United States [25]. Moreover, procurement conducted by small and medium enterprises in New Zealand from vendors had been inefficient. This issue could be addressed through consolidated model of procurement [26]. Furthermore, there are several stages in order to increase efficiency in project management in centralized public procurement. The first is to develop organizational culture, for example by hiring highly qualified employees. The second is work satisfaction; that is by giving a fair pay to every employee commensurate with their responsibility. The third is the importance of job analysis so that there is a clear job structure for each employee [27].

Consolidated procurement of goods/services is adopted not only by private and government organizations as a strategy to address inefficiency issue in procurement of goods/services, but also by humanitarian aid organizations in distributing aid during disasters. In humanitarian logistics, competition among organizations was centered around securing funding. However, consolidated procurement could help address the issue as it enabled humanitarian aid organizations to procure and distribute more goods/services to reach more beneficiaries and reduce logistic cost. Nevertheless, this was not without challenges. Challenges in the consolidated logistics in humanitarian aid include the political characteristics of the organization, cultural issues that could lead to differences in needs and preferences for goods as well as different languages which could hinder distribution of goods, and the higher number of actors which on the one hand is beneficial, yet on the other hand could be a complex endeavour that could in the end be time consuming and result in increased consolidation and other costs.

3. Methodology

This study employed a qualitative approach. Qualitative approach is a process of inquiry to understand a social issue through the creation of holistic and complete pictures formulated in words (sentences), to be reported based on detailed research perspectives and scientific background [29]. In the same vein, to uncover meanings from human behavior is a sensual thing in qualitative research, whereby the researcher is interested not only in what is being done by humans, but also in the meaning of individual perspectives [28]. Therefore, in this study we chose to use the qualitative research paradigm since the researchers sought to understand the strategies, challenges, and benefits of consolidated procurement of 2013 nation curriculum reference books.

This study used two qualitative data collection techniques, namely in-depth interview and literature study. The rationale for these qualitative techniques is to obtain in-depth data or information. The interview is done to obtain empirical data about the social world by asking the interviewees to talk about their lived experience [13]. In-depth interview was conducted by the researchers to further understand the informants' interpretation of strategies, challenges and benefits of consolidated procurement of the 2013 nation curriculum reference books. The informants in this study came from the National Public Procurement Agency (LKPP), the Ministry of Education and Culture, and publishers as vendors in the procurement of the national reference books. In addition to the in-depth interview, the researchers also conducted a literature study to support the primary data gathered through the interview. The literature involved included books, articles, laws and regulations, journal articles, undergraduate theses, master's theses, and other relevant documents. In this study, the researchers collected and studied the data relevant to strategies, challenges, and benefits of consolidated procurement of the 2013 nation curriculum reference books.

The data was analysed qualitatively using the inductive approach, whereby the researchers conducted the analysis based on the collected data. There are several stages in data analysis, namely preparing and organizing the data obtained from field notes, in-depth interviews, and other sources of information to support the analysis; reading and connecting the entire information that has been obtained to the theories; processing the data into segments prior to making sense of the data and extracting data in the form of words or pictures gathered through data collection into categories; explaining the settings, people, categories, and themes to be analyzed; representing the descriptive results in the form of qualitative narrative; and formulating interpretations based on the findings to be presented in a descriptive research report [29].

4. Findings

4.1 Procurement of National Reference Books

The procurement of the national reference books under scrutiny in this research was motivated by the change in the curriculum instigated by the then Minister of Education. The previous curriculum, the School-based Curriculum (KTSP), was replaced by the 2013 National Curriculum. The new 2013 National Curriculum was to be implemented in all levels of schooling, including primary and secondary education. The Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture Number 67 of 2013 on the Basic Framework and Structure of the Curriculum of Primary Education states that one juridical foundation for the 2013 curriculum is the Government Regulation Number 32 of 2013 on the amendment of the Government Regulation Number 19 of 2005 on the National Standards of Education.

The change in the curriculum necessitated new reference books that are in accordance with the 2013 national curriculum. To implement the 2013 national curriculum at

every school, the required number of reference books for students and teachers all across Indonesia was 274,000,000. The first procurement of the reference books was carried out between February and June 2014 to procure 170 million books, while the remaining 100 million reference books were to be procured in the subsequent procurement. Based on the procurement plan of the Ministry of Education and Culture, the student books for semester I were expected to be available in each school by 1 July 2014. The second procurement, to procure the student books for semester II, was expected to make the books available in each school by 1 December 2014 [30]. The massive quantity of books required and the need for even distribution of the reference books for all schools in Indonesia were reasons for the consolidated national procurement of the reference books coordinated directly by the National Public Procurement Agency (LKPP). As a strategic procurement, this consolidated procurement was the first in Indonesia, hence the strategies and challenges at each stage of the process. The following details the strategies adopted by LKPP at each stage of the consolidated procurement process.

4.2 Consolidated Procurement Planning as a Crucial Stage

The consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books denotes that the government was fully responsible for the availability of the reference books. The government in this context refers to the Ministry of Education and Culture, but as the Ministry of Education and Culture was not able to handle the procurement process on its own, it requested assistance from LKPP. Head of Sub-Directorate East Region I, the Directorate of Advocacy and Appeal Settlement East I, the National Public Procurement Agency, explained that the government had to step in and ensure the availability of the reference books. The planning stages of the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books included surveying and comparing book prices on the market, and analysis of goods and suppliers, carried out by LKPP for about two months. LKPP adopted several strategies to carry out the planning activities. First, LKPP surveyed the market in order to check the availability of reference books and to compare prices. The book that was used as a benchmark was an elementary school book titled “*Aku dan Sekolahku*” or “My School and I”. LKPP visited several bookstores and printing houses around Senen area. Second, LKPP calculated the printing cost of books based on a formula available on the Internet. Third, LKPP compared book prices by referring to previous reference book contracts from the Ministry of Education and Culture [30]. The resulting book price comparisons based on the market analysis conducted by LKPP are presented in (table 1).

Table 1. Price comparison for national curriculum reference books (Before the consolidated procurement)

| No. | Method | Price | Remarks |
|-----|---|-----------|--|
| 1. | Direct survey to bookstores in Depok | Rp75,000 | Exclusive of shipping cost |
| 2. | Direct survey to small-medium printing houses in Senen area | Rp28,000 | Exclusive of shipping cost and only able to print 10,000 books a month |
| 3. | Estimation based on a formula on the Internet | Rp63/page | Exclusive of shipping cost |
| 4. | Previous contracts from the Ministry of Education and Culture | Rp9,900 | Inclusive of shipping cost up to Aceh |

Based on the information in the table above, the price based on the previous contracts from the Ministry of Education and Culture was the lowest, Rp9,900 inclusive of shipping cost up to Aceh. However, LKPP did not directly use this as the price estimate (HPS) because it was feared that the tendering would fail due to the low price of Rp9,900. However, Head of Sub-Directorate East Region I, the Directorate of Advocacy and Appeal Settlement East I, the National Public Procurement Agency, the price of Rp9,900 was used as a price reference and was considered logical [30].

LKPP's concern about the possibility of failure in tendering was not only due to the price estimate (HPS) but also due to suppliers' unreadiness to supply the massive quantity of books. Therefore, LKPP carried out supplier analysis to find suppliers that would have the capacity to take the job and would participate in the tendering. In this

supplier analysis, LKPP was assisted by the Indonesian Association for Publishers (IKAPI) and *Pusat Grafika Indonesia* or now known as the State Polytechnic of Creative Media (POLIMEDIA). Based on the analysis, 26 suppliers were considered to have the capacity to provide the 2013 national curriculum reference books. In addition to setting the price estimate (HPS) and selecting prospective suppliers, the planning stage was also crucial in terms of determining the procurement regions/clusters whereby LKPP created clusters based on geographic proximity and availability of suppliers. LKPP finally determined 74 regional clusters for the procurement of the reference books to cover all schools in Indonesia. This clustering was aimed at facilitating a cross-subsidy scheme to ensure a standardized price of the reference books across regions. This was markedly different compared to before the consolidated procurement where significant price differences were the case, as presented in Table 1 above.

4.3 Supplier Selection and Clustering into 74 regions

Supplier selection for the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books was conducted by LKPP via catalogue tendering. The process of supplier selection and contract awarding in this catalogue tendering was similar to that in the non-catalogue tendering [31]. The invitation to tender to the prospective suppliers was issued online by LKPP, but the *aanwijzing* process (tender briefing meeting) was done face-to-face due to limitations in providing information via online chat, necessitating a face-to-face meeting between LKPP and the prospective suppliers. Section Head of South Sumatera Region, the National Public Procurement Agency, stated that LKPP gave the opportunity to the prospective suppliers to ask questions directly [32].

After the tender briefing meeting, tendering for the procurement by the suppliers commenced. The prospective suppliers were given opportunity to tender based on the 74 regions that have been established. Suppliers were to be responsible for the provision of the 2013 national curriculum reference books in the respective regions. The suppliers were not limited to tender for one region, meaning they could tender for more regions. However, they should consider their capability and capacity. Schools could then only place orders to the suppliers that were awarded contract for their respective regions and could not place their orders to other suppliers [32].

Following the tendering by the prospective suppliers, contracts to supply the 2013 national curriculum reference books were awarded. Thirty-seven suppliers were awarded the contracts and were responsible for the provision of the 2013 national curriculum reference books for elementary schools, junior high schools, senior high schools, and vocational high schools. These suppliers had met the requirements stipulated by LKPP as stated in the procurement catalogue document of the 2013 national curriculum reference books. These requirements included possessing a business licence as regulated by the prevailing laws and regulations to print books, publish books, and other relevant business licenses. They must have paid taxes in the previous year (2012 annual Tax Return, monthly Tax Return for December 2013, January 2014, and February 2014). They had to have capacity to provide facilities/tools/equipment to carry out the job, namely having a minimum of one four-color sheetfed offset or web offset printers and one perfect binding machine, and experience in book printing.

4.4 Contract Delivery and its Associated Issues

After the suppliers for the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books were awarded contracts, the next stages were printing and distributing the reference books by the suppliers. The umbrella contract was agreed and signed by the suppliers on 30 April 2014, and the reference books began to be printed on 1 May 2014. Starting 2 May 2014, schools could begin placing orders to the suppliers and on 14 May 2014 reference book distribution to schools commenced. Between 1 and 30 June

2014, the reference books were expected to arrive in schools. Furthermore, the schools placed the reference books orders themselves [33]. However, besides placing orders, schools also paid the invoice directly to suppliers. This was because the purchase of the 2013 national curriculum reference books was funded using the School Operational Fund (BOS), and the fund had already been disbursed to every school [31].

The procurement contract delivery of the 2013 national curriculum reference books was not without issues. The first issue was the delay in the book order placement because there were school principals both in remote areas outside Java Island and on Java Island who lacked Internet literacy and the poor Internet reception in remote areas in Indonesia [33]. The second issue concerned the shipping cost. Because the majority of suppliers were based on Java Island, the shipping cost varied considerably across regions. For schools located on Java Island, shipping cost was considerably lower than for schools located outside Java Island as most suppliers were located on Java Island. Another reason for the differences in the shipping cost is the lack of alternative transportation to distribute the reference books to certain areas, especially for elementary schools because at least there is one elementary school in every village [20].

The third issue concerned payment by the schools. Giving the school the responsibility to directly pay for the reference books to the suppliers resulted in certain issues. Quite often schools denied responsibility by not paying the invoice. Therefore, the suppliers had to bear the extra cost to visit the schools to directly deliver the reference books. This cost was higher than to ship the reference books, due to difficult access to certain schools [30]. The fourth issue was the limited availability of paper. General Manager PT Gramedia Asri Media, explained that the massive procurement within a short timeframe had led to the scarcity of paper on the market [34]. Furthermore, the scarcity of paper was also caused by the limited number of paper suppliers on the market [35]. They also added that the majority of paper was allocated for export than for domestic market [35].

4.5 Challenges and Advantages

The consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books was the first and largest consolidated procurement in Indonesia. A few challenges emerged during the process. The first challenge was in the establishment of the price estimate (HPS) for the 2013 national curriculum reference books by the working unit. The working unit was concerned of the possibility of tendering failure due to the low-price estimate. Another related challenge was the resentment of and criticism from the prospective suppliers during the tender briefing meeting, as they considered the price estimate too low and disproportionate to the production cost [32]. Second, the majority of the suppliers were based on Java Island because almost all the prospective suppliers that met the required specifications for the 2013 national curriculum reference book tendering were also based on Java Island [30]. The impact of this was the considerable difference in

distribution cost. Furthermore, this caused the high shipping cost of the reference books to certain remote areas, especially islands. Third, the lack of Internet literacy among school principals, especially those from remote areas, hindered the placement of orders for the 2013 national curriculum reference books via LKPP's e-catalogue. Moreover, poor internet reception in those areas also contributed to the challenge in order placement for the 2013 national curriculum reference books [30].

The challenges faced by the stakeholders in the implementation of the consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books were proportionate to the advantages. The first advantage was reduction in the purchasing cost. As discussed in the planning of the procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books, the government established the price estimate (HPS) at Rp9,900. This price was significantly lower than the price offered by suppliers during market analysis. LKPP believed that this low price could not have been possible had the procurement been done by individual schools without consolidation [30]. The second advantage is reduction in procurement and tendering management cost. This is similar to the reduction in purchase cost due to the consolidated procurement. The consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books also resulted in reduced administrative costs associated with the procurement and tendering by the suppliers. This was because the fewer procurement packages required less time and the procurement process for the 2013 national curriculum reference books had to be completed within five months [35].

The merging of procurement packages due to the consolidation led to this reference book procurement to routine procurement to leverage quadrant, hence the reduced risk of unavailability and the potentially increased profits. Additionally, the merging of procurement packages led to the reduced purchase price because the government had a stronger bargaining position than the suppliers, so the government could determine the purchase price according to their estimate. The third advantage is reduction in non-compliance among stakeholders. This was due to the consolidated nature of the procurement whereby all the processes were carried out by the central government, in this case LKPP. Schools could not carry out their own procurement, and suppliers could not freely determine the price of the reference books. Evidence suggests that corruption was rampant before the consolidated procurement was adopted. Other evidence also suggests that schools were often deceived by suppliers because they were not aware of market price of the reference books. Therefore, the consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books could reduce the room for corruption because the price was set by LKPP, although it could not completely prevent corruption in the procurement sector [35].

5. Conclusions

The consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books was the first and largest in Indonesia. Although consolidated procurement had not

become a mainstream procurement method among institutions in Indonesia, this consolidated procurement was considered a success in achieving its aim, the provision and even distribution of reference books for elementary, junior high, and senior high schools in Indonesia with standardized processes and price. This served as a solution to issues associated with isolated procurement done by individual schools whereby reference books prices differed significantly between schools on Java Island and those outside Java Island. Schools on Java Island enjoyed the wide availability of and proximity to suppliers, hence the low distribution cost. This was certainly not the case for schools outside Java Island with limited number of suppliers and the distance, increasing the reference book price. Therefore, with the School Operational Fund they received, these schools could not purchase reference books for all the students. It can be argued that this consolidated procurement could be considered a crucial and innovative breakthrough. The most significant strategy in this consolidated procurement was the formation of 74 regional procurement clusters whereby suppliers focused on printing and distributing reference books to their respective regions. Challenges emerged throughout the process from planning, supplier selection, and contract delivery.

Consolidation strategy in the procurement of goods/services in this procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books was carried out in three procurement stages. First, the planning stage comprises analysis of price, goods, and suppliers, as well as setting the price estimate (HPS). The second stage is supplier selection, which comprises tendering and contract awarding based on the regions. The third stage is contract delivery. In this stage, schools and local education agencies placed reference book orders via LKPP e-catalogue and suppliers distributed the reference books to schools based on the orders. Several challenges were identified in the consolidated procurement of the national curriculum reference books. The challenges included concerns regarding possibility of tendering failure, the low-price estimate according to the suppliers, the suppliers being concentrated on Java Island, the lack of Internet literacy especially among school principals in remote areas affecting the placement of orders for the 2013 national curriculum reference books, the short timeframe forcing the procurement committee to work extra hard, and suspicion of corruption committed by the procurement committee. Advantages of the consolidated procurement of the 2013 national curriculum reference books included reduction in purchasing cost, procurement and tendering management cost, and non-compliance, as well as increased satisfaction among stakeholders.

REFERENCES

- [1] Listyanto, Apri. (2012). Pembaharuan Regulasi Pengadaan Barang dan Jasa Pemerintah. *Jurnal RechtsVinding*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp.113 – 133.
- [2] Lembaga Kebijakan Pengadaan Barang dan Jasa Pemerintah. (2017). *Kredibel: Majalah Pengadaan Indonesia Edisi 8*. Jakarta: LKPP

- [3] Sembiring, Lidya Julita. (2017). Pengadaan Barang Jasa Pemerintah Capai Rp 1.200 Triliun di 2018. Available at: <https://economy.okezone.com/read/2017/12/05/20/18/25434/pengadaan-barang-jasa-pemerintah-capai-rp1-200-triliun-di-2018> (accessed: 03 October 2019).
- [4] OECD. (2011). Centralised purchasing systems in the European Union, SIGMA Papers No. 47, OECD Publishing, Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development.
- [5] Kaufmann, D. (2005). *10 Myths About Governance and Corruption. Journal Finance and Development*, Vol. 43, No. 3, pp.41-43.
- [6] Saepulloh, Rahmat. (2018). KPK: Pengadaan Barang Rawan Korupsi. Available at: <https://www.wartaekonomi.co.id/read172754/kp-pengadaan-barang-rawan-korupsi.html> (accessed: 03 October 2019).
- [7] Indonesiacorruptionwatch. (2018). Tren Penindakan Kasus Korupsi (per Semester I 2018). Available at: https://www.antikorupsi.org/sites/default/files/tren_penindakan_kasus_korupsi_smt_1_2018_0.pdf (accessed: 04 October 2019).
- [8] LKPP. (2018). Laporan Kinerja Tahun 2018 LKPP. Available at: http://www.lkpp.go.id/v3/files/attachments/5_EiqomIKtCbrwymSpKBgnhdzozQrPXusM.pdf (accessed: 08 October 2019).
- [9] LKPP. (2017). LKPP dan 18 Pemerintah Daerah Susun Rencana Aksi Pengadaan. Available at: <http://www.lkpp.go.id/v3/#/read/4827> (accessed: 10 October 2019).
- [10] Vaillancourt, A. (2016). "A theoretical framework for consolidation in humanitarian logistics", *Journal of Humanitarian Logistics and Supply Chain Management*, Vol. 6, No. 1, pp. 2-23.
- [11] Nollet, J., & Beaulieu, M. (2005). Should an organisation join a purchasing group?. *Supply Chain Management: An International Journal*, Vol. 10, No. 1, pp.11-17.
- [12] Schotanus, F., Telgen, J., & de Boer, L. (2010). Critical success factors for managing purchasing groups. *Journal of purchasing and supply management*, Vol. 16, No 1, pp.51-60.
- [13] Silverman, David. (2015). *Qualitative Research*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd
- [14] Khan, Naushad. (2018). "What Is Public Procurement: Introduction", *Public Procurement Fundamentals*, Emerald Publishing Limited, pp. 1-20.
- [15] Afifah, Riana. (2012). *Ini Alasan Dirombaknya Kurikulum*. Available at: <https://edukasi.kompas.com/read/2012/11/29/11113348/Ini.Alasan.Dirombaknya.Kurikulum> (accessed: 02 Oktober, 2019).
- [16] Antara (2013). *Kemendikbud: Tiga Skenario Pengadaan Buku Kurikulum 2013*. Available at: <https://sumbar.antaranews.com/berita/54634/kemdikbud-tiga-skenario-pengadaan-buku-kurikulum-2013> (accessed: 20 January, 2020).
- [17] Napitupulu, Ester Lince. (2012). Buku Pelajaran Disiapkan Pemerintah. Available at: <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2012/11/28/1015523/buku.pelajaran.disiapkan.pemerintah> (accessed: 25 October 2019).
- [18] Fahmi, Ismail. (2014). *Pengadaan Buku Kurikulum: LKPP Mediator, Tender ditiadakan*. Available at: <https://kabar24.bisnis.com/read/20140307/255/208731/pengadaan-buku-kurikulum-lkpp-mediator-tender-ditiadakan> (accessed: 05 October, 2019)
- [19] Tempo. (2014). Percetakan Tak Selesaikan Buku Kurikulum 2013. Available at: <https://nasional.tempo.co/read/599309/percetakan-tak-selesaikan-buku-kurikulum-2013> (accessed: 10 October 2019).
- [20] Li, Lixin., Zhang, Yibo., Sun, Hao. (2012). Research on the Centralized Procurement Mode of Construction Projects Materials. *Applied Mechanics and Materials*, Vol. 193-192 pp. 333-336.
- [21] Orina, Ruth Kerubo., Kimencu Linda. (2018). Centralized Purchasing Strategies and Organizational Performance in the Manufacturing Industry: A Case of Mabati Rolling Mills, Vol. 20, No. 7, pp. 05-13.
- [22] Islam, MD. Taslimul. (2014). *Effectiveness of Centralized Procurement Systems in Public Sector Enterprises of Bangladesh: A Focus on Economic Census 2013*. Working paper Brac Institute of Governance and Development, Brac University: Dhaka.
- [23] Aboelazm, K.S., Afandy, A. (2019). Centralization and decentralization of public procurement: Analysis for the role of General Authority for Governmental Services (GAGS) in Egypt. *Journal of Advances in Management Research*, Vol. 16, No. 3, pp. 262-276.
- [24] Junior, Waldemiro Francisco Sorte (2013) 'Assessing the efficiency of centralised public procurement in the Brazilian ICT sector', *International Journal of Procurement Management*, Vol. 6, No. 1 pp. 58-75.
- [25] Levin, Jonathan., et al. (2019). Consolidated Drug Purchasing Across Federal Agencies: A Policy to Decrease Cost Sharing for Medicare Beneficiaries, *Journal of Health Care Finance*, Vol. 46 No. 1, pp.1-10.
- [26] Wilson, M.M.J., Roy, R. N. (2009), Enabling lean procurement: a consolidation model for small and medium sized enterprises, *Journal of Manufacturing Technology Management*, Vol. 20, No. 6, pp.817-833.
- [27] Wang, Y., Liu, J., Zuo, J., Rameezdeen, R. (2019). "Ways to improve the project management efficiency in a centralized public procurement system: A structural equation modelling approach". *Engineering, Construction and Architectural Management*, Vol. 27, No. 1, pp.168-185.
- [28] Alwasilah, Chaedar. (2006). *Pokok Kualitatif: Dasar-Dasar Merancang dan Melakukan Penelitian Kualitatif, Cetakan Ketiga*. Jakarta: Pustaka Jaya.
- [29] Cresswell, John W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches*. USA: SAGE Publication Inc.
- [30] Yulianto Prihandoyo. (20 February 2020). Interview.
- [31] Herdiana (04 February 2020) Interview.
- [32] Fajar Adi Hermawan (15 February 2020). Interview.
- [33] Junus Simangunsong (02 March 2020). Interview.
- [34] Irawan (04 April 2020.) Interview.
- [35] Sumanto. (19 February 2020). Interview.